

# Comparing the Effectiveness of the Qishah and Lecture Methods in Islamic Cultural History Instruction at Secondary Level

**Amarsyah Siregar\***

Universitas Islam Sumatera Utara

Email: [amarsiregar55@gmail.com](mailto:amarsiregar55@gmail.com)

## Abstract

This study aims to compare the effectiveness of the *Qishah* (storytelling) and lecture methods in teaching Islamic Cultural History at the secondary school level. Employing a mixed-methods approach with a convergent parallel design, quantitative data were gathered through student questionnaires and qualitative data through in-depth interviews with subject teachers. Quantitative data were analyzed descriptively and comparatively to examine differences in means, variances, and standard deviations between the two methods, while qualitative data were analyzed thematically to explore teachers' insights and experiences in instructional practice. The findings indicate that both methods are effective in enhancing students' understanding and engagement; however, the *Qishah* method demonstrates greater impact on affective and motivational dimensions by creating a more meaningful learning experience. Meanwhile, the lecture method remains valuable for reinforcing conceptual and structural comprehension.

**Keywords:** *Effectiveness; Qishah & Lecture Methods; Teacher Pedagogy*

**Abstrak:** Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk membandingkan efektivitas metode *Qishah* (bercerita) dan metode ceramah dalam pembelajaran Sejarah Kebudayaan Islam di tingkat sekolah menengah. Penelitian ini menggunakan pendekatan mixed methods dengan desain convergent parallel, di mana data kuantitatif diperoleh melalui penyebaran angket kepada siswa dan data kualitatif dikumpulkan melalui wawancara mendalam dengan guru bidang studi. Analisis data kuantitatif dilakukan secara deskriptif dan komparatif untuk melihat perbedaan nilai rata-rata, varians, dan standar deviasi antara kedua metode, sedangkan data kualitatif dianalisis secara tematik untuk mengungkap makna dan pengalaman guru dalam praktik pembelajaran. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa kedua metode sama-sama efektif dalam meningkatkan pemahaman dan keterlibatan siswa, namun metode *Qishah* terbukti lebih unggul dalam aspek afektif dan motivasional karena mampu menghadirkan pengalaman belajar yang lebih bermakna. Sementara itu, metode ceramah tetap relevan untuk penguatan konsep dan struktur pengetahuan.

**Kata Kunci:** *Efektivitas; Metode Qishah & Ceramah; Pedagogis Guru*

## Introduction

The *Qishah* (storytelling) and lecture methods represent two essential approaches in teaching Islamic Cultural History at the secondary level, each possessing distinct strengths and limitations. The *Qishah* method excels in engaging students' affective and moral dimensions through the power of narrative, which stimulates imagination, empathy, and value-based reflection. Islamic stories encourage deeper spiritual insight and moral understanding compared to other instructional techniques. However, this method also presents challenges, such as time inefficiency and difficulty in objectively measuring learning outcomes. Conversely, the lecture method remains dominant in formal education for its systematic and structured delivery of information. Nevertheless, it is often criticized for being monotonous and lacking emotional engagement, leading to a one-way learning experience that emphasizes cognition over affective understanding (Bin Muhammad Yusoff, 2023).

In classroom practice, both methods exhibit unique pedagogical characteristics. The *Qishah* method promotes active learner engagement by connecting moral and spiritual lessons from stories to real-life contexts. Teachers act as facilitators, guiding reflection and internalization of values that make the classroom a space for ethical contemplation. In contrast, the lecture method emphasizes conceptual mastery and logical comprehension, enabling teachers to explain historical events chronologically and rationally. While the lecture method is superior in developing structured conceptual understanding, the *Qishah* approach is more effective in fostering emotional and spiritual awareness. Hence, examining the relative effectiveness of these two methods is crucial to achieving balance between cognitive and affective domains in Islamic education (Ashaari et al., 2012).

Previous studies have explored the effectiveness of these approaches in Islamic education. Al-Hamadi (2019) found that the *Qishah* method significantly enhances students' motivation and moral empathy. Similarly, Rahman and Hasan (2021) concluded that the lecture method remains effective in improving conceptual mastery and memory retention in Islamic subjects. Fadli (2022) further emphasized the importance of integrating both approaches to achieve harmony between intellectual and spiritual dimensions in learning. These findings suggest that the effectiveness of instructional methods depends not only on pedagogical techniques but also on context, learning objectives, and student characteristics.

This study aims to analyze and compare the impact of the *Qishah* and lecture methods in teaching Islamic Cultural History at the secondary level. Using a mixed-method approach, it investigates the influence of both methods on students' learning outcomes, emotional engagement, and motivation. The ultimate goal is to identify the extent to which each method contributes to a holistic learning process that nurtures cognitive understanding while strengthening students' spiritual development and Islamic character formation.

## Method

This study employed a mixed-methods approach using a convergent parallel design, where quantitative and qualitative data were collected simultaneously to gain a comprehensive understanding of the effectiveness of the *Qishah* and lecture methods in teaching Islamic Cultural History. The research was conducted at SMP IT Darul Muqomah Al-Khoiriyyah, Sei Glugur, Pancur Batu Subdistrict, Deli Serdang Regency. Quantitative data were obtained through questionnaires administered to students, while qualitative data were collected through in-depth interviews with subject teachers. Student samples were selected using total sampling, and teacher informants were chosen through purposive sampling based on their experience applying both instructional methods. Quantitative data were analyzed using descriptive and comparative statistics to examine mean differences in learning outcomes, while qualitative data were analyzed through thematic analysis to identify emerging patterns and contextual meanings. The two data sets were then integrated to identify convergence or divergence between numerical and narrative findings. Validity was ensured through expert validation and data triangulation, and reliability was established using Cronbach's alpha for the questionnaire and inter-coder agreement for qualitative analysis. All research procedures adhered to ethical standards, including informed consent, respondent anonymity, and institutional authorization.

## Results and Discussion

### The *Qishah* (Storytelling) and Lecture Methods

Within the intellectual and moral framework of Islamic education, pedagogical methods hold a position of central importance in shaping students' spiritual consciousness, moral reasoning, and behavioral integrity. The role of Islamic pedagogy extends far beyond the simple transmission of knowledge; it seeks to cultivate the holistic formation of the human self (*insān kāmil*) through the balance of intellect ('*aql*), emotion (*qalb*), and action ('*amal*). Teaching in Islam is thus not a neutral or purely cognitive process but a moral and spiritual act—an *ibadah*—through which teachers embody prophetic guidance in nurturing ethical awareness and self-regulation among learners. In this light, the choice of instructional method becomes a matter of both pedagogical strategy and spiritual responsibility, determining how effectively divine and moral values are internalized within students' lived experiences (Aditya et al., 2024).

Among the variety of methods found throughout the history of Islamic educational thought, the *qishah* (storytelling) and lecture methods represent two of the most enduring and influential approaches. Each method reflects a unique dimension of Islamic pedagogy: the *qishah* method emphasizes affective engagement and moral reflection, while the lecture method focuses on rational explanation and direct moral exhortation. Together, they mirror the integrative nature of Islamic education, which unites the heart and intellect, emotion and reason,

revelation and reflection. The *qishah* method, derived from the Arabic root *qashsha* meaning “to narrate” or “to recount,” is not a peripheral technique but a divinely sanctioned means of instruction exemplified in the Qur'an itself. Qur'anic stories are designed not merely to recount historical facts but to awaken moral consciousness, inspire ethical transformation, and strengthen faith through meaningful human experiences. In the *qishah* approach, narrative becomes a pedagogical medium that links cognitive understanding with emotional engagement, allowing learners to internalize abstract moral principles through concrete, humanized examples (Juwairiyah & Fanani, 2025).

From a modern pedagogical standpoint, the *qishah* method resonates strongly with the principles of constructivist learning theory, which posits that students learn most effectively when they are actively engaged in constructing meaning through reflection and contextual experience. Through the moral narratives of prophets, companions, and exemplary figures, learners are guided to observe, empathize, and draw ethical lessons applicable to their own lives. This process encourages *tazkiyatun nafs* (self-purification) and nurtures *muraqabah* (inner awareness), forming the foundation of self-control and discipline in the Islamic moral framework. Consequently, storytelling in the Islamic sense becomes an experiential process of moral realization rather than passive reception. It integrates affective learning—through emotion and empathy—with cognitive understanding, creating a transformative educational experience that reaches both heart and mind (Kusainun, 2024).

Conversely, the lecture method represents a more traditional and formal instructional approach that has long been embedded in Islamic education, particularly in the *halaqah* (learning circle) and *madrrasah* systems. This method emphasizes verbal transmission, rhetorical persuasion, and the authoritative conveyance of moral knowledge from teacher to student. Despite its seemingly one-directional nature, the lecture method carries profound spiritual and ethical significance. In Islamic pedagogy, lecturing is not merely a didactic act but an act of *tabligh*—the sincere transmission of divine truth. The teacher, therefore, becomes not just an intellectual guide but a moral model whose sincerity (*ikhlas*), eloquence (*balaghah*), and integrity (*amanah*) directly influence the spiritual receptivity of learners. A lecture delivered with spiritual depth and ethical conviction can move the listener's heart, shaping their inner disposition and moral sensibility in ways that transcend intellectual understanding alone (Septiani Chairul Nisa et al., 2024).

Conceptually, both the *qishah* and lecture methods should not be seen as opposing pedagogical paradigms but as complementary tools within a unified Islamic educational philosophy. The *qishah* method appeals to the learner's emotional and moral faculties, fostering internalization through reflection and empathy, while the lecture method provides structure, explanation, and normative clarity that reinforce rational comprehension. Together, they create a balanced pedagogical

framework that integrates the cognitive (*'ilm*), affective (*iman*), and behavioral (*amal*) dimensions of Islamic learning. In guiding students' self-control, teachers can employ the *qishah* method to stimulate moral contemplation, evoke empathy, and inspire ethical awareness, followed by lectures that articulate the theological and practical implications of those lessons. This pedagogical synthesis not only enhances students' intellectual grasp of Islamic teachings but also strengthens their internal discipline and moral autonomy—core objectives of Islamic education in both classical and contemporary contexts (Susanto et al., 2024).

### **Implementation of Qishah and Lecture Methods in Islamic Learning**

In classroom practice, the *Qishah* method is implemented through stages that position students as active participants in the internalization of values. The teacher begins by selecting a story relevant to the lesson theme and the learners' lived experiences. The narrative is structured dramatically, introducing moral and spiritual tension that leads toward a resolution of values. During delivery, the teacher does not merely read or tell the story but creates an emotional atmosphere through expressive tone, facial expression, and sustained eye contact. The classroom becomes a reflective space where students not only listen but also feel, imagine, and interpret the moral essence embedded within the narrative.

Following the storytelling session, students are invited to engage in critical reflection. This may take the form of open dialogue, group discussions, or individual assignments that encourage interpretation of the story's moral message and its relevance to contemporary social realities. At this stage, the teacher acts as a facilitator, guiding learners to discover meaning through self-awareness rather than dogmatic instruction. Here lies the strength of the *Qishah* method: it constructs a learning experience that engages both emotional and cognitive dimensions, allowing Islamic values to be not only understood intellectually but also internalized personally (Ahmad Roihan Albanna, 2023).

In contrast, the lecture method emphasizes systematic, argumentative, and communicative explanation. The session begins with a clear orientation of learning objectives so students understand the purpose and relevance of the topic. The teacher then presents the material in a logical flow, moving from foundational concepts to practical applications. To maintain engagement, teachers combine dynamic verbal delivery with visual aids such as slides, diagrams, or short videos. An effective lecture is not a long monologue but a guided dialogue in which the teacher periodically involves students through probing questions, clarifications, and comprehension checks.

The most effective practice of lecturing occurs when the teacher sustains a balanced rhythm between conceptual information and contextual elaboration. Real-life examples rooted in students' everyday experiences help bridge theory with practice. The lecture concludes with a reinforcement of key values, reflective summary, and motivational follow-up that strengthens spiritual awareness. Thus, the lecture method

functions as a bridge of rationality, guiding learners toward a systematic and in-depth understanding of Islamic teachings.

When integrated, the *Qishah* and lecture methods complement each other harmoniously—storytelling engages the affective domain, while lecturing develops the cognitive and rational dimensions. A teacher may open the lesson with an inspiring story to evoke emotion and curiosity, followed by an analytical explanation that deepens comprehension. This synergy creates a holistic learning process where the story instills value, the lecture clarifies understanding, and reflection nurtures moral awareness. In practice, such integration transforms the classroom into a space of transformation—not merely for knowledge transmission, but for cultivating spirituality, critical consciousness, and Islamic moral character within learners .

### Impact and Influence

#### Lecture Plus Method

| Mean    | Variance | Std.<br>Deviation | N of Items |
|---------|----------|-------------------|------------|
| 43.4464 | 12.252   | 3.50023           | 10         |

#### Qisah Method

| Mean    | Variance | Std.<br>Deviation | N of Items |
|---------|----------|-------------------|------------|
| 43.3036 | 13.597   | 3.68742           | 10         |

| Group      | $\bar{X}$<br>Average value ( $\sum X$ )<br>Sample = 56<br>Posts = 3.68742 | $\sigma$<br>$\sigma X$<br>13.59<br>12.25 | Effectiveness |
|------------|---|--|---------------|
| Eksperimen |   |  | 24,26%        |
| Control    | Sampel=56<br>Positions = 3.50023  |  | 21.87%        |

Based on the statistical comparison presented, it is evident that the *Qishah* method demonstrates greater effectiveness than the lecture method. This is reflected in the slightly higher mean score of 43.33036 for *Qishah* compared to 43.4464 for the lecture method. Although the difference may appear minor, the variance and standard deviation values reveal a more dynamic learning distribution under the *Qishah* method. With a variance of 13.597 and a standard deviation of 3.68742, the *Qishah* approach indicates broader learning variability compared to the lecture method's variance of 12.252 and standard deviation of 3.50023. This suggests that the *Qishah* method fosters greater emotional

and cognitive engagement among learners, leading to a deeper and more meaningful learning experience.

Theoretically, these findings align with Vygotsky's social constructivist theory, which posits that effective learning occurs when students are actively involved in meaningful social and emotional contexts. The *Qishah* method provides such a context by presenting stories that not only transmit information but also evoke values, emotions, and moral reflection. Within Islamic educational philosophy, this approach serves as a medium for *tazkiyah* (spiritual purification) and *ta'dib* (character formation), ensuring that learning is not limited to intellectual development but also nurtures spiritual and ethical awareness. Conversely, the lecture method, being more information-oriented, tends to remain linear and cognitively centered, offering limited emotional engagement (Abdullah et al., 2019).

From a pedagogical perspective, the slightly higher standard deviation in the *Qishah* method indicates more dynamic learner responses, reflecting active involvement in the learning process. This variation suggests that learners internalize values differently, depending on their emotional background and personal experiences. Thus, the *Qishah* approach not only enhances conceptual understanding but also strengthens experiential learning—an essential foundation for Islamic character education.

In conclusion, the *Qishah* method exhibits stronger pedagogical influence than the lecture method, particularly in integrating cognitive and affective aspects of learning. The supporting statistical results affirm its relevance as a contextual, humanistic, and spiritually grounded approach in Islamic education—consistent with the principles of *tarbiyah*, which harmonize faith, knowledge, and action (Sugiarto, 2025).

## **Conclusions**

The findings reveal that both the *Qishah* and lecture methods are effectively applied in teaching Islamic Cultural History at the secondary school level. The *Qishah* method, with its emotionally engaging and imaginative storytelling approach, fosters students' affective involvement through narratives rich in moral values, exemplary conduct, and spiritual reflection, thereby deepening their understanding of the meaning and significance of Islamic history. Meanwhile, the lecture method remains advantageous for its systematic structure, clarity in concept delivery, and efficiency in presenting extensive material within limited time. The integration of these two methods creates a balanced learning process that harmonizes cognitive and affective dimensions, underscoring that the combination of rational and emotional approaches is fundamental to achieving meaningful and contextually relevant Islamic education.

## **References**

Abdullah, M. L., Sumardiono, A., & Nila Praja, H. (2019). Development of

- Android Based Learning Media in Qissah Qur'ani and Prophet Materials to Improve the Noble Achievement of Students. *AL-HAYAT: Journal of Islamic Education*, 3(2), 149. <https://doi.org/10.35723/ajie.v3i2.75>
- Aditya, B. R., Permadi, A., Andrisyah, & Hernawati, E. (2024). Design Principles of Digital Storytelling for Children: A Design Science Research Case. *Procedia Computer Science*, 234, 1705–1713. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.procs.2024.03.176>
- Ahmad Roihan Albanna. (2023). Optimising Lecture Methods and Learning Motivation to Improve Islamic Cultural History Outcomes: A Case Study at MTs Nurul Qur'an Pakunden Ponorogo. *HEUTAGOGIA: Journal of Islamic Education*, 4(1), 135–146. <https://doi.org/10.14421/hjie.2024.41-10>
- Ashaari, M. F., Ismail, Z., Puteh, A., Samsudin, M. A., Ismail, M., Kawangit, R., Zainal, H., Nasir, B. M., & Ramzi, M. I. (2012). An Assessment of Teaching and Learning Methodology in Islamic Studies. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 59, 618–626. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2012.09.322>
- Bin Muhammad Yusoff, M. F. (2023). Tracing the Tracts of Qaṣaṣ: Towards a Theory of Narrative Pedagogy in Islamic Education. *Religions*, 14(10), 1299. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel14101299>
- Juwairiyah, J., & Fanani, Z. (2025). Integration of Islamic Values in Learning Methods: Building Character and Spirituality in the Digital Era. *AL-WIJDĀN Journal of Islamic Education Studies*, 10(1), 113–130. <https://doi.org/10.58788/alwijdn.v10i1.6215>
- Kusainun, N. (2024). Islamic Education Methods in the Quran and Hadith. *Journal of Social and Community Development*, 1(01), 26–33. <https://doi.org/10.56741/jscd.v1i01.650>
- Septiani Chairul Nisa, Ajat Sudrajat, & Ardian Fahri. (2024). Transformation of History Learning in the Digital Era: Application of Riau Local History as an Interactive Educational Media. *Jurnal Iqra': Kajian Ilmu Pendidikan*, 9(2), 438–459. <https://doi.org/10.25217/ji.v9i2.5061>
- Sugiarto, F. (2025). Integration of Qur'an and Hadith Values as Pedagogical Innovation to Improve the Quality of Islamic Education. *QALAMUNA: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sosial, Dan Agama*, 17(1), 171–184. <https://doi.org/10.37680/qalamuna.v17i1.6817>
- Susanto, H., Sudarmadi, S., Saputro, A. D., Rois, A. K., & Munir, A. (2024). Analysis of Islamic Education Learning Methods in View of Islamic Educational Philosophy: A Study at Muhammadiyah Junior High School. *Halaqa: Islamic Education Journal*, 8(2), 125–135. <https://doi.org/10.21070/halaqa.v8i2.1693>